WeBER III
WESTERN BALKAN ENABLERS FOR REFORMING PUBLIC ADMINISTRATIONS

PAR Principles Mainstreaming in Sectoral Policies

Dardan Abazi I July, 2024

Raport for Kosovo

Grupi për Studime Juridike dhe Politike

PAR AREA: Service Delivery & Digitalisation
INSTITUTON: Ministry of Economy
POLICY SECTOR: Energy

Contents

Report summary

The assessment of the Ministry of Economy's policies and initiatives related to energy efficiency reveals significant gaps in several critical areas, including mechanisms for user feedback, transparency in publishing feedback, demographic segmentation of feedback, adaptation of services for vulnerable groups, availability of different service access channels, e-services, and the accessibility and openness of sector-specific data.

Current services lack structured mechanisms for users to provide feedback on the quality of services received (Requirement 1). This results in users having to resort to indirect methods, such as contacting officials instead, which is neither practical nor conducive to efficient feedback collection. In addition to contacting officials directly, citizens often resort to other informal and unstructured methods of providing feedback on energy efficiency services, such as voicing concerns on social media, sending emails to general inboxes, or expressing opinions through third-party platforms and media outlets. These approaches are typically inefficient, leading to fragmented feedback that lacks consistency and depth. There is no formal mechanism for collecting and publishing feedback for public review (Requirement 2). This lack of visibility discourages user engagement and leaves feedback largely inaccessible. Enhancing transparency through the development of a feedback collection system integrated within each program, analysing collected feedback, and regularly publishing detailed reports on citizen feedback and satisfaction are necessary steps.

The Ministry also lacks any structured feedback data collection that segregates feedback based on demographics such as gender, age, education, and geographical location (Requirement 3). Implementing standardized feedback forms that collect demographic information and publishing detailed reports that segregate feedback data by these demographics can address this gap. Additionally, while the Ministry provides some financial support aimed at vulnerable groups, the services are not explicitly adapted to meet their unique needs (Requirement 4). Enhancing programs by detailing how services are adapted for vulnerable groups, ensuring accessibility, and conducting targeted outreach programs is essential for meeting this requirement. Implementing Targeted Outreach Programs like partnering with NGOs and using multiple communication channels ensures vulnerable groups are aware of available support, addressing the lack of special outreach efforts.

The Ministry offers several channels for accessing information and services but lacks comprehensive details and outreach programs (Requirement 5). Improvements can include implementing community outreach programs, ensuring accessibility measures, and regularly updating and promoting the different channels available. While progress has been made in providing e-services through the platform eKosova1, allowing users to apply for subsidies online, further enhancements could include online feedback mechanisms to continuously improve e-services based on user experiences (Requirement 6).

Information on sector-specific services is available but not comprehensive or fully up-to-date, resulting in partial fulfilment of this requirement (Requirement 7). More frequent and thorough updates are needed to ensure the reliability and completeness of the information. Lastly, most reports and documents are provided in PDF format, limiting accessibility and reusability for data analysis and integration (Requirement 8). Providing data in open formats such as CSV, JSON, or XML, and developing APIs for automated data access would significantly enhance data usability. We recognize that the Department of Energy within the Ministry of Economy has only relatively recently begun offering services directly to citizens, and our report and monitoring indicate that there is substantial opportunity for improvement, which presents a positive outlook for future developments.

---

1 eKosova is a state portal where public services that are found in offices and physical wickets of institutions are offered in an electronic way. Link

I. Introduction

I.1 What does WeBER monitor and how?

The monitoring in the Service Delivery and Digitalisation (SDD) area is performed against three SIGMA Principles.

> *Principle 19: Mechanisms for ensuring the quality of public services are in place.*
>
> *Principle 20: The public administration delivers streamlined and high-quality services.*
>
> *Principle 21: Administrative services are easily accessible online and offline, taking into account different needs, choices and constraints.*

SD checklist consists of 8 requirements that pertain to possibilities for service users to voice their opinion about the quality of sector-specific administrative services, data transparency and accessibility, and practices of electronic service provision. Specifically, when it comes to sending feedback on obtained services, it is monitored whether feedback channels are embedded into website of service provider or government-sponsored service delivery portals, and whether submitted feedback is made public. In relation to accessibility, it is monitored whether responsible service provider ensures conditions for vulnerable and marginalised population to easily obtain services they need, and whether there are at least two options for accessing them (digital, and in-person). In addition, monitoring focuses on whether practice of collecting and publishing data on accessibility exists (such as statistics, analyses, reports or similar). Electronic service provision is further monitored for the purpose of determining the level of presence and development of e-services (based on four-tier classification of the United Nations). Finally, the last requirement looks whether practices of publishing open data related to service provision are established, and how regularly open datasets are publicly disclosed for further (re)use.

For data collection, approach to this checklist relies on review of website of assessed service provider, government-sponsored portals for centralised service delivery, e-services, and open data, but also on filing of requests for free access to information for all documents that are not available online. Depending on individual requirement, timeframe of analysis covers current practices, that exist at the time of assessment, as well as two years past for availability of specific data on accessibility and citizen feedback.

I.2 In this report

The structure of the report is organized to provide a comprehensive and detailed examination of the Ministry of Economy's policies and initiatives, focusing specifically on the delivery and accessibility of energy-related services. The report begins with a Report Summary that encapsulates the key findings and recommendations, followed by an Introduction section, which sets the stage for the analysis.

In the Introduction, the report outlines the scope and methodology of WeBER's monitoring activities. This includes a detailed explanation of what WeBER monitors and the methods employed to gather and assess data. The introduction also previews the contents and structure of the report.

The core of the report is found in the Analysis section, which is meticulously divided into specific requirements. Each requirement corresponds to a critical area of service delivery and accessibility. The analysis covers:

- Requirement 1: Evaluation of mechanisms allowing users to provide feedback on service quality.

- Requirement 2: Examination of the transparency and availability of information regarding citizen feedback and satisfaction.

- Requirement 3: Assessment of the detail and demographic segmentation of published feedback data.

- Requirement 4: Analysis of how services are adapted to meet the needs of vulnerable groups.

- Requirement 5: Review of the availability and accessibility of various channels for accessing sector-specific services.

- Requirement 6: Overview of the development and availability of e-services.

- Requirement 7: Evaluation of the accessibility of information on sector-specific services.

- Requirement 8: Assessment of the availability and usability of sector-specific data in open formats.

Following the detailed analysis, the Final Assessment of the Requirements provides a summary evaluation, highlighting the key areas for improvement and recognizing progress where applicable.

The report concludes with a Recommendations for Improvements section, which offers actionable suggestions aimed at enhancing the quality and accessibility of services provided by the Ministry of Economy. Additionally, the Appendices section includes supporting information such as responses to free access to information requests, interviews conducted with relevant stakeholders, and references to other sources used throughout the report. This supplementary material provides further context and substantiates the findings presented in the main body of the report.

II. Analysis

The Ministry of Economy of Kosovo's website lacks a formal feedback mechanism for users to easily voice their opinions on service quality, relying instead on basic contact details for general communication. This limitation prevents structured feedback collection and transparency. Additionally, no data on citizen satisfaction with the services is published, and demographic segregation of feedback, such as by gender, age, or territorial distribution, is also absent. Although some targeted initiatives exist for vulnerable groups, like those addressing informal waste collectors or increasing women's participation in the energy sector, the Ministry lacks a cohesive strategy to consistently adapt services to meet the needs of all vulnerable populations.

While the Ministry offers multiple channels for accessing sector-specific services, including the eKosova platform, the overall availability and consistency of these channels remain incomplete. E-services have seen progress, particularly in online applications, but full digital integration across all sectors is still lacking. Information on service accessibility, including accommodations for vulnerable groups or people with disabilities, is limited, and published data often appears in less usable formats like PDFs. Thus, while there has been notable development in e-services, gaps in accessibility, user feedback, and transparency hinder full compliance with outlined service requirements.

Requirement 1: Users are enabled to voice their opinion on the quality of services received

Upon reviewing the documents related to energy efficiency subsidies, it is clear that they lack any mechanisms or dedicated platforms for users to provide feedback on the quality of services provided by the Ministry of Economy. The documents, including the Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar Sys-

tem (Ministry of Economy, 2023a), 2the Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b)3, and the Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c)4, provide information on application processes, eligibility criteria, and contact information. However, none of the documents include specific channels or platforms for users to voice their opinions or provide feedback on the services received. This absence of feedback mechanisms limits users from sharing their experiences or suggestions for improvement, a critical aspect in ensuring service quality and responsiveness. Instead, users seeking to provide feedback must rely on indirect methods such as contacting Ministry officials via phone oe-mail. As noted previously, based on information from our interview5 with the Acting Head of Division at the Ministry of Economy.

The Ministry primarily provides contact information such as email addresses and phone numbers, which are useful for inquiries and support but do not constitute a feedback mechanism. For example, the Department of Post, Telecommunications, and Information and Communication Technology provide email contacts and phone numbers for direct communication, but these channels are not specifically designed for collecting user feedback on service quality. As a result, this requirement is not met due to the absence of a formal and user-friendly feedback mechanism.

Requirement 2: Information on citizen feedback and satisfaction with received services is published

Currently, upon reviewing the Ministry of Economy's website, it is very clear that there is a no formal mechanism for collecting and publishing feedback for public review. The absence of such platforms means that citizens are unable to easily share their experiences and opinions on the services they receive. Moreover, this lack of visibility further makes the problem worse, as it discourages user engagement and feedback submission. As a result, the feedback that could potentially improve services and enhance transparency remains largely inaccessible to both service providers and the general public.

This was determined through a review of the relevant documents that there is no formal mechanism for collecting or publishing feedback. The Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar System (Ministry of Economy, 2023a) ,6 Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b)7, and Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c) 8all lack any mention of structured platforms for feedback collection. Interviews further confirmed that no user-friendly channels are in place for gathering or publishing citizen input, highlighting a gap in transparency and service improvement.9

The existing infrastructure does not support a transparent feedback loop, making it challenging for the public to assess the quality and effectiveness of services. This gap highlights a significant area for improvement in ensuring that citizen feedback is systematically collected, published, and utilized to enhance service delivery.

2 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar System (Ministry of Economy, 2023) - Link

3 Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b) – Link

4 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c)

5 Interview with Acting Head of Division at the Ministry of Economy 10.06.2024.

6 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar System (Ministry of Economy, 2023) - Link

7 Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b) – Link

8 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c)

9 Interview with Acting Head of Division at the Ministry of Economy 10.06.2024.

The aforementioned documents posted by the Ministry of Economy highlight significant initiatives. However, upon detailed examination of these documents, it is apparent that there is no evidence of published information on citizen feedback or satisfaction with the services received.

The posted public calls offer comprehensive information on the program's objectives, eligibility criteria, and application process. Despite the thoroughness of the provided details, there is an absence of any section or reference to published citizen feedback or satisfaction metrics. The calls do not mention whether any feedback from previous users has been collected, analyzed, or made available to the public. It should also be noted that no Freedom of Information (FOI) request was made by us to determine whether such data exists beyond the publicly accessible documents.

The Ministry has held public consultations and events, such as the Kosovo Digital Agenda 2030[10], where they engage with professionals and stakeholders to discuss future plans and gather input. While these events are important for collecting feedback, the results and citizen satisfaction metrics from these engagements are not clearly published on the website.

There are instances where the Ministry responds to media reports to clarify the use of funds and the effectiveness of their programs, such as the response to allegations regarding the misuse of energy efficiency subsidies. However, these responses are reactive and do not constitute a proactive approach to publishing comprehensive citizen feedback and satisfaction data. Since structured feedback collection and public data sharing are lacking, this requirement remains unmet, as there is no systematic provision of information on service perceptions or improvements based on feedback.

Requirement 3: Published data on citizen feedback is segregated based on gender, age groups, education, and territorial distribution

After carefully reviewing the available documents published from the Ministry of Economy like The Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar System (Ministry of Economy, 2023a)[11], Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b)[12], and Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c)[13] we can say there is no data published on citizen feedback, let alone any segregation of such data based on specific demographics such as gender, age groups, education, or territorial distribution. The absence of any structured feedback data collection and publication significantly undermines the ability of the Ministry to understand and respond to the diverse needs of its citizens.

This lack of detailed feedback data prevents the Ministry from gaining insights into how different segments of the population perceive and experience the services provided. Without segregated feedback data, the Ministry cannot accurately assess how different demographic groups benefit from or are affected by these programs. This gap hinders the ability to tailor services to meet the unique needs of various population segments and highlights a significant gap in the Ministry's approach to understanding and addressing the diverse needs of its citizens.

While the Ministry has made efforts to engage with the public and gather feedback through various initiatives, such as public consultations, the feedback collected is not published at all so we do not have any feedback from the Ministry. The consultations focus on gathering input and discussing future plans, but the results are not published at all. The Ministry does highlight efforts to promote gender equality in the energy sector and to ensure women's participation in ICT and STEM fields[14], which

---

10 Kosovo Digital Agenda 2023 – Link

11 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Sanitary Water Heating Solar System (Ministry of Economy, 2023) - Link

12 Public Call for Support of Household Consumers to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023b) – Link

13 Public Call for Support of Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises to Invest in Renewable Energy Systems – Photovoltaic (PV) System for Generation of Electricity for Self-Consumption (Ministry of Economy, 2023c)

14 https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/rizvanolli-kosovo-is-an-example-in-the-region-in-terms-of-participation-of-women-in-the-energy-

shows an awareness of demographic considerations. However, this does not extend to publishing segregated feedback data in a systematic way. Yet the Ministry efforts still do not constitute a fulfilling of the requirement. The Ministry's inability to break down feedback by demographic factors limits its capacity to meet the needs of different groups. Consequently, this requirement is not met due to the lack of systematic data collection or publication.

Requirement 4: Service provision is adapted to the needs of vulnerable groups

The documents posted by the Ministry of Economy regarding public calls, provides some indication that the Ministry of Economy is considering vulnerable groups to some extent.

The Energy Strategy 2022-2031 15includes measures aimed at increasing the participation of women in the energy sector, reflecting a focus on gender inclusivity. According to the Strategy, the Government plans to collaborate closely with academic institutions, industry stakeholders, and development partner organizations to design and align education and training programs with the specific needs of the energy sector. This partnership will be structured to ensure equal opportunities for women's participation in these programs, including the provision of scholarship schemes, and will actively promote the inclusion of women in energy sector companies and institutions. (Ministry of Economy of the Republic of Kosovo. (2023). Energy Strategy of the Republic of Kosovo 2022–2031). 16Specific Objective 4.3: Training in energy-related fields and women's inclusion. Additionally, the strategy emphasizes the fair representation of women and young girls among the beneficiaries of these programs, particularly in areas related to renewable energy. These measures reflect a broader commitment to addressing the needs of all relevant vulnerable groups, as outlined in the checklist, ensuring that inclusivity and equity remain core priorities in the energy sector's development. The strategy envisages increasing the share of renewable energy sources and ensuring that women and young girls are represented fairly among the beneficiaries of training programs.

Additionally, while the Ministry has promoted aspects of the subsidy program to encourage the adoption of energy-efficient heating systems among households, the adaptation of these services specifically for vulnerable groups remains insufficient. According to Requirement 4 of the Service Delivery and Digitalization area of the Public Administration Reform, services must be adapted to the needs of vulnerable groups. In this context, the Ministry's efforts fall short, as they do not fully address the accessibility conditions required for vulnerable populations. Based on the assessment guideline, where full access for vulnerable groups is necessary to meet the requirement, the current state of service provision could only be classified as "Requirement partially met" or potentially even "Requirement not met," given that these groups are not adequately considered in the service design. While the strategy mentions the provision of financial support and the goal to enhance energy efficiency in residential units, which could indirectly benefit vulnerable groups by reducing energy costs and improving living conditions. However, it lacks explicit details, on how these measures are tailored to meet the unique needs of vulnerable populations such as low-income families, elderly individuals, or those with disabilities. There are no outlined provisions or targeted initiatives aimed explicitly at ensuring that these populations have access to the benefits of increased energy efficiency, nor are there details on how the program will accommodate the particular challenges these groups face, such as financial barriers, accessibility issues, or limited resources. This lack of direct acknowledgment leaves a gap in the strategy, missing an important opportunity to ensure that the most vulnerable are supported in the transition to a more energy-efficient and sustainable future.

For instance, for single parents and beneficiaries of the social assistance scheme (category I & II), a subsidy is available: ninety percent (90%) for an individual biomass stove and sixty percent (60%) for an air-to-air inverter heat pump (efficient air conditioner/climate)17. To receive this subsidy, single parents must upload one document proving their status, and social assistance beneficiaries must upload one proof of their beneficiary status. While the financial support for energy-efficient heating

sector/
15 Energy Strategy 2022-2031 - Link
16 Energy Strategy 2022-2031 - Link
17 Ministry of Economy opens the Call for Subsidy of Efficient Heating Equipment for Households - Link

systems could greatly benefit low-income households by reducing their heating costs, the document does not specify any additional assistance or simplified application procedures targeted specifically at these groups. There is also no mention of special outreach efforts to ensure that vulnerable populations are aware of and can easily access these programs. Although some initiatives exist, service adaptation is inconsistent across all areas, meaning this requirement is only partially met.

Requirement 5: Different channels for accessing sector-specific services are made available to users

The Ministry of Economy announcements page provides several channels through which users can access information and services related to energy efficiency and renewable energy subsidies. Specifically, the "Public call for energy efficiency subsidies18" indicates multiple ways for users to engage and read the specific public calls.

For instance, applications for subsidies can be made online through the eKosova platform, which facilitates the application process by allowing users to submit their applications and required documents digitally. The website indicates that users can apply for certain energy efficiency measures through this platform. However, it should be noted that only some of these services are accessible through these digital channels, and not all subsidy applications or energy-related services are fully integrated into the platform. Despite this limitation, the availability of online access is a crucial step in ensuring that users can conveniently apply for subsidies without the need to visit physical locations. locations.

Additionally, the announcements detail the availability of email and phone support for further inquiries and clarifications. Users can contact the Ministry via specific email addresses and phone numbers provided in the announcements for assistance. This support is available during business hours, ensuring that users can seek help if they encounter any issues during the application process. However, while electronic access for some services is verified, it is not explicitly confirmed whether the majority of services offer both in-person and electronic access. This leaves some uncertainty about whether users can rely solely on electronic channels for a wide range of services or if they may need to visit physical locations for certain aspects of the application process. Despite the availability of basic contact details and instructions, inconsistencies in service access through multiple channels prevent full accessibility, leading to this requirement being only partially met.

Requirement 6: E-services are developed and available to users

The Ministry of Economy of Kosovo has made substantial progress in developing and providing e-services to users, as evidenced by the resources available on their website. Mainly through only one platform, the eKosova platform. Based on the functionalities described for the eKosova platform, it goes beyond the Enhanced Presence stage, progressing into the Transactional Presence stage. In the Enhanced Presence stage, users primarily access information, such as updates on energy efficiency subsidies and financial support programs.

The public calls for energy efficiency subsidies and other initiatives are accessible through the eKosova platform, which allows users to apply for various subsidies online. For instance, applications for subsidies related to energy efficiency measures, such as external house insulation and replacement of windows and doors, can be submitted digitally via this platform. This online system facilitates the application process, making it more convenient for users to access services without needing to visit physical locations.

The eKosova platform offers several functionalities that enhance its role as a digital service hub. It allows users to apply for energy efficiency subsidies, submit required documents online, and access relevant information, demonstrating its support for Enhanced Interaction (Stage 2) in the UN e-Government Development Classification. The platform facilitates two-way interactions by enabling users to communicate with the Ministry of Economy via email and phone for further inquiries or clarifications, though this remains limited to basic communication channels rather than fully integrated digital services.

---

18 Public call for energy efficiency subsidies - Link

Additionally, announcements related to financial support for energy efficiency projects, renewable energy investments, and NGO participation are regularly updated on the website. These updates ensure that users are informed about the latest opportunities and can access relevant services and information online. However, the platform does not yet fully support Transactional Services or Connected Services (Stages 3 and 4), as it lacks more advanced, integrated features such as real-time tracking of applications, automated notifications, or direct feedback mechanisms. While eKosova streamlines the application process and allows for some interaction, it currently does not extend into fully integrated, multi-channel services that would signify progression beyond the Enhanced Presence stage into the Transactional or Connected Services stages.

To further enhance the provision of e-services, the Ministry could consider implementing online feedback mechanisms to collect user feedback on e-services, enabling continuous improvement based on user experiences. Additionally, features such as: Real-time application tracking, Automated notifications, Integrated feedback mechanisms, Cross-departmental coordination for services and user dashboards for managing multiple services or applications in one place, would be necessary to establish Connected Presence. Though e-services exist, the lack of full integration and optimization across all sectors results in this requirement being partially fulfilled.

Requirement 7: Information on the accessibility of sector-specific services is available to users

There is some information available to users regarding sector-specific services, but it is not comprehensive and often lacks the most current updates. While the data provided is no older than two years, it still falls short of being considered up-to-date. This inconsistency makes it challenging for users to rely on the information fully. Consequently, when evaluating the provided information, one might be tempted to choose between "fully met" and "partially met." However, given the present circumstances and the state of the available data, it is more appropriate to conclude that the requirement is only "partially met." The lack of recent updates undermines the reliability and completeness of the information, highlighting the need for more frequent and thorough updates to meet user expectations fully. The limited information on accessibility features means this requirement is only partially satisfied.

Requirement 8: Data relevant to sector-specific services is available in open formats

While the Ministry of Economy offers various reports, public calls, and updates on sectors specific services, these documents are typically provided in PDF format. This format does not support the level of accessibility and reusability associated with open data formats like CSV, JSON, or XML, which are crucial for data analysis and integration into other applications or systems.

For instance, announcements regarding energy efficiency subsidies and renewable energy projects are detailed and updated but remain in PDF format, limiting their usefulness for more advanced data analysis and automated processes. There are no clear indications that datasets are available in more flexible formats, nor is there mention of APIs (Application Programming Interfaces) for automated data access. While some data is provided, it is not in a format conducive to easy reuse or analysis, leaving this requirement only partially fulfilled.

Final assessment of the requirements

Requirement	Final assessment
Users are enabled to voice their opinion on the quality of services received	Not met
Information on citizen feedback and satisfaction with received services is published	Not met
Published data on citizen feedback is segregated based on gender, age groups, education, and territorial distribution	Not met
Service provision is adapted to the needs of vulnerable groups	Partially met
Different channels for accessing sector-specific services are made available to users	Partially met
E-services are developed and available to users	Partially met
Information on the accessibility of sector-specific services is available to users	Partially met
Data relevant to sector-specific services is available in open formats	Partially met

Requirement 1: Users are enabled to voice their opinion on the quality of services received:

The Ministry of Economy of Kosovo's website lacks a clear, structured system for users to provide feedback on the quality of services. While contact information like email addresses and phone numbers is available, these are mostly used for inquiries and general communication. There is no dedicated platform or form to gather organized feedback on service quality. This limits user engagement and transparency. Additionally, the site does not feature a feedback button or an online form, making it difficult for users to share their opinions. Consequently, this requirement is unmet as there is no formal, easy-to-use feedback mechanism.

Requirement 2: Information on citizen feedback and satisfaction with received services is published:

There is no publicly accessible data on citizen feedback or satisfaction with services provided by the Ministry. While the Ministry responds to specific media reports or public concerns, such as issues related to energy efficiency subsidies, these are reactive measures. There is no continuous publication of feedback data. Furthermore, no regular reports, satisfaction surveys, or engagement summaries are made available online. The absence of structured feedback collection and public sharing of data means this requirement is unmet, as the Ministry does not systematically provide information on service perceptions or how feedback influences improvements.

Requirement 3: Published data on citizen feedback is segregated based on gender, age groups, education, and territorial distribution:

The Ministry of Economy does not publish citizen feedback segregated by demographic categories such as gender, age, education level, or location. Public reports and calls regarding initiatives like energy efficiency and renewable energy programs do exist, but they do not include data that allow for analysis of how various population groups use these services. This lack of demographic breakdown limits the Ministry's ability to address the specific needs of different user groups. As such, the requirement for segregated citizen feedback remains unmet, and there is no evidence of systematic data collection or publication.

Requirement 4: Service provision is adapted to the needs of vulnerable groups:

The Ministry has taken steps to address the needs of vulnerable groups, though these efforts are not consistently applied across all areas. For instance, the Ministry supports Roma, Ashkali, and Egyptian communities in informal waste collection19 and works to increase women's participation in the energy sector20. Additionally, the Kosovo Digital Economy Project (KODE) 21aims to create job opportunities

---

19 Informal waste collectors - Link

20 https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/rizvanolli-kosovo-is-an-example-in-the-region-in-terms-of-participation-of-women-in-the-energy-sector/

21 Kosovo Digital Economy Project (KODE) - Link

for unemployed and underemployed youth. However, these initiatives do not constitute a comprehensive strategy for consistently adapting services to meet the needs of all vulnerable populations. As a result, while there are some positive examples, service adaptation is not fully realized across all areas.

Requirement 5: Different channels for accessing sector-specific services are made available to users:

The Ministry of Economy offers several ways to access sector-specific services, including the eKosova platform for online applications, email and phone support, and limited in-person assistance. Although eKosova enables users to apply for services like energy efficiency subsidies, other access points, such as in-person services, are inconsistently documented or available. While basic instructions and contact information are provided, the lack of consistent availability of all services through multiple channels hinders full access. Therefore, this requirement is only partially fulfilled.

Requirement 6: E-services are developed and available to users:

The Ministry has made significant strides in developing e-services, notably through the eKosova platform, which facilitates online applications for services such as energy efficiency subsidies. However, the digital transformation of services is not complete, as some services still rely on phone or email communication. While e-services are available, full integration and optimization across all sectors are not yet achieved, meaning this requirement is only partially met.

Requirement 7: Information on the accessibility of sector-specific services is available to users:

Basic information about sector-specific services can be found on the Ministry's website and through the eKosova platform. However, there is little detail on accessibility features, such as support for people with disabilities or multilingual services. Additionally, there is a lack of comprehensive information on the accessibility of physical offices or services for vulnerable groups. This limited accessibility information results in this requirement being only partially met.

Requirement 8: Data relevant to sector-specific services is available in open formats:

Although the Ministry publishes data on various initiatives and projects, it is typically presented in PDF format, which restricts its usability as open data. No datasets are available in widely accepted open formats like CSV, XML, or JSON. Additionally, there is no clear information on data update frequency or open data licensing on the Ministry's website. Although some data is available, it is not easily reusable or analyzable, leaving this requirement only partially fulfilled

III. Recommendations for improvements

The monitoring of the Ministry of Economy in the policy sector of energy efficiency and renewable energy initiatives has highlighted several gaps that need addressing to improve user feedback mechanisms, transparency, inclusivity, and accessibility. Despite clear details on application processes and eligibility criteria, there is an absence of structured platforms for users to voice their opinions, which hinders meaningful feedback collection and analysis. Moreover, the current infrastructure does not support transparent feedback loops, segregated feedback data, or tailored services for vulnerable groups, limiting the Ministry's ability to respond effectively to diverse user needs. These gaps undermine the Ministry's efforts to ensure good service delivery. The following recommendations aim to address these issues through targeted short-, mid-, and long-term interventions, enhancing the overall quality, accountability, and responsiveness of the Ministry's public services.

Requirement 1: Users are enabled to voice their opinion on the quality of services received

1. Implement an Online Feedback Platform (Short-term)

The absence of a structured feedback mechanism makes it difficult for users to share their experiences or suggestions. An online platform would streamline feedback collection, making it more user-friendly and efficient, thus addressing the current gap where users need to contact officials directly. E-Kosova is a good basis but a better user-interface and the ability for the users to provide feedback is missing.

2. Establish Feedback Analysis and Reporting System (Mid-term)

Analysing collected feedback and publishing reports demonstrates a commitment to continuous improvement and builds trust. This recommendation addresses the lack of efficient feedback collection or analysis.

Requirement 2: Information on citizen feedback and satisfaction with received services is published

1. Develop Feedback Collection System (Short-term)

The current infrastructure does not support transparent feedback collection, which limits user engagement. A dedicated system would facilitate easy feedback submission, ensuring more comprehensive data collection.

2. Publish Feedback Reports (Mid-term)

Publishing detailed reports on citizen feedback enhances transparency and informs the public about the Ministry's responsiveness. This addresses the absence of published information on user satisfaction.

Requirement 3: Published data on citizen feedback is segregated based on gender, age groups, education, and territorial distribution

1. Standardize Feedback Forms with Demographic Data (Short-term)

Collecting demographic information alongside feedback enables meaningful analysis and helps tailor services to different population segments, addressing the current lack of detailed feedback data.

2. Publish Segregated Feedback Reports (Mid-term)

Segregating feedback data by demographics provides insights into how different groups perceive services, enhancing the Ministry's ability to address diverse needs effectively.

Requirement 4: Service provision is adapted to the needs of vulnerable groups

1. Implement Targeted Outreach Programs (Mid-term)

Partnering with NGOs and using multiple communication channels ensures vulnerable groups are aware of available support, addressing the lack of special outreach efforts.

2. Monitor and Evaluate Program Impact (Long-term)

Regular evaluation and adjustment based on findings improve service delivery and effectiveness for vulnerable groups, addressing the lack of targeted adaptation in current programs.

Requirement 5: Different channels for accessing sector-specific services are made available to users

1. Enhance Community Outreach Programs (Short-term)

Community outreach programs ensure broader engagement and assistance, particularly in underserved areas, addressing the need for detailed and accessible service channels.

2. Ensure Accessibility Measures (Short-term)

Making all communication channels accessible to individuals with disabilities ensures inclusivity, addressing the need for comprehensive accessibility measures.

Requirement 6: E-services are developed and available to users

1. Expand Online Feedback Mechanisms (Short-term)

Collecting user feedback on e-services enables continuous improvement based on user experiences, addressing the need for feedback mechanisms in the current e-service offerings.

Requirement 7: Information on the accessibility of sector-specific services is available to users

1. Improve Data Update Frequency (Short-term)

More frequent updates ensure the information remains relevant and reliable, addressing the inconsistency and lack of up-to-date data in the current information.

Requirement 8: Data relevant to sector-specific services is available in open formats

1. Provide Data in Open Formats (Mid-term)

Offering data in open formats like CSV, JSON, or XML enhances usability and integration, addressing the current limitation of data being in less flexible formats. The Government should consider amending the current regulations, including the Law No. 06/L-081 on Access to Public Documents to address the Open Formats matter.

Appendices

Free access to information requests

[Authors populate the list below on number of FOI requests sent, and dates of receiving information. Insert as many rows as needed]

Institution	Date of sending	Date of receipt
Ministry of Economy	08.05.2024	19.05.2024
Kosovo Agency of Statistics	08.05.2024	N/A

Interviews

[Authors populate the list below on number of interviews held, if any, dates/place of holding interviews and interviewees' affiliation and position. Personal names are not to be inserted in respect to anonymity principle. In case no interviews were held, this part is skipped. Insert as many rows as needed]

Institution/Organisation	Position	Date	Place
Ministry of Economy	Acting Head of Division	10.06.2024	Ministry of Economy premises in Pristina
Ministry of Economy	Former Head of Department	12.06.2024	INDEP office, Pristina

Other sources

[Authors draw a list of all the sources used such as legislation, policy documents with the Official Gazette numbers, implementation/monitoring reports, analyses, studies, online articles, etc.]

Ministry of Economy Announcements Page:

Ministry of Economy Announcements (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/announcements-2/)

Description: This page provides various announcements but lacks a dedicated feedback mechanism for users to voice their opinions on service quality.

Kosovo Digital Agenda 2030:

Kosovo Digital Agenda 2030 (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/public-consultations-held-on-the-kosovo-digital-agenda-2030/)

Description: Public consultations and events related to the digital strategy of Kosovo, but no clear publication of citizen feedback data.

Response to Media Reports:

Response to Allegations on Energy Efficiency Subsidies (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/response-to-the-article-citizens-receive-funds-for-efficient-equipment-but-spend-it-elsewhere/)

Description: The Ministry responds to media reports regarding the misuse of funds, but this is reactive and not comprehensive feedback publication.

Public Calls and Updates:

Public Calls for Energy Efficiency Subsidies (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/announcements-2/)

Description: Information on public calls and updates but lacks segregation of feedback data by demographics.

Participation of Women in Energy Sector:

Participation of Women in Energy Sector (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/rizvanolli-kosovo-is-an-example-in-the-region-in-terms-of-participation-of-women-in-the-energy-sector/)

Description: Efforts to increase women's participation in the energy sector, but no segregated feedback data is published.

Energy Strategy 2022-2031:

Source: Energy Strategy 2022-2031 (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/the-working-group-and-the-vision-of-the-energy-strategy-2022-2031-are-introduced/),

(https://me.rks-gov.net/wp-content/uploads/2023/04/Energy-Strategy-of-the-Republic-of-Kosovo-2022-2031-1-1.pdf)

Description: Presentation and development of the Energy Strategy with a focus on renewable energy and gender inclusivity.

Energy Efficiency Subsidies and Renewable Energy Projects:

Public Calls for Energy Efficiency Subsidies (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/announcements-2/)

Description: Access to services via the eKosova platform and contact information for inquiries.

eKosova Platform:

eKosova Platform (https://ekosova.rks-gov.net/)

Description: Platform that allows users to apply for services online, indicating development of e-services.

Energy Efficiency Subsidies and Renewable Energy Projects:

Public Calls for Energy Efficiency Subsidies (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/announcements-2/)

Description: Details on applying for subsidies, but lacks comprehensive information on accessibility features.

Data Formats for Public Calls:

Public Calls for Energy Efficiency Subsidies (https://me.rks-gov.net/en/announcements-2/)

Description: Documents are typically in PDF format, not in open data formats like CSV, JSON, or XML.

Informal waste collectors - https://me.rks-gov.net/en/blog/informal-waste-collectors-should-be-incorporated-into-the-waste-management-system/

Kosovo Digital Economy Project

(https://www.rit.edu/kosovo/kode%23:~:text=The%20Government%20of%20Kosovo%20has,digital%20transformation%20and%20Policy%20fulfillment.)